Cognitive Flexibility and Theory of Mind Outcomes Among Foster Children: Preschool Follow-Up Results of a Randomized Clinical Trial

Erin Lewis-Morrarty, Ph.D., Mary Dozier, Ph.D.*, Kristin Bernard, M.A., Stephanie M. Terracciano, and Shannon V. Moore

University of Delaware, Newark, Delaware

Article history: Received November 22, 2011; Accepted May 4, 2012

Keywords: Attachment; Cognitive flexibility; Early intervention; Executive function; Foster care; Parenting; Preschool; Theory of mind

ABSTRACT

Young children who experience early adversity are at risk for problems regulating emotions, behavior, and physiology, which in turn place them at risk for later psychopathology, school problems, and peer relation difficulties. Therefore, early parenting interventions are critical in helping this vulnerable population develop adequate self-regulatory capabilities. Attachment and Biobehavioral Catch-up (ABC) is an intervention developed to help parents learn to behave in ways that enhance young children’s self-regulatory capabilities.

In the present study, we found that preschool-aged foster children who had received the ABC intervention showed stronger cognitive flexibility and theory of mind skills, relative to foster children who had received a control intervention. Foster children who had received the ABC intervention showed capabilities in these areas that were not significantly different from a comparison group of children who were never in foster care. These findings are promising in suggesting that the ABC intervention enhances the development of foster children’s self-regulatory capabilities.

© 2012 Society for Adolescent Health and Medicine. All rights reserved.
Both executive function and theory of mind abilities develop rapidly between the ages of 3 and 6 years, a time that coincides with a period of rapid growth of the prefrontal cortex [18,19]. Age-related changes in the prefrontal cortex during this period include both increases in gray and white matter volume and in interhemispheric connectivity [20–22]. Neuroimaging and event-related potential studies suggest that both executive function and theory of mind capabilities are to some extent dependent on prefrontal cortex functioning, in coordination with other brain areas, such as the hippocampus and the amygdala [23–26].

Foster care placement increases the risk for later correlates of executive function deficits, such as symptoms of inattention and hyperactivity, disruptive behavior disorders, and academic problems [1,2,5,27,28]. Additionally, foster children show deficits in theory of mind [6], which may contribute to the peer relation difficulties often seen in this population [29]. Such deficits may reflect changes to biological systems brought about by early life stress [30]. In particular, preschool-aged foster children tend to show altered hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal system functioning, often characterized by a lower flatter pattern of diurnal cortisol production, relative to comparison children [31–33]. Such irregularities in diurnal cortisol production, in turn, may have damaging effects on the developing brain, particularly in the hippocampus, amygdala, and prefrontal cortex regions, brain areas associated with executive function and theory of mind [33–36].

Attachment and Biobehavioral Catch-up Intervention

Responsive caregiving early in life (i.e., parental sensitivity, secure attachment, and frequent coordinated social attention) has been associated with children’s later self-regulatory, executive function, and theory of mind abilities [37–39]. The Attachment and Biobehavioral Catch-up (ABC) intervention is a 10-session manualized parenting program aimed at enhancing young children’s self-regulatory capacities by helping caregivers to provide nurturing and synchronous care. These two intervention components (i.e., nurturance in response to child distress and synchronous parent–child interactions) are targeted in a number of ways. Interventionists describe the importance of providing nurturing and synchronous care, based on developmental research. Additionally, interventionists videotape parent–child interactions during structured activities designed to help caregivers practice being synchronous by “following the child’s lead.” Interventionists provide feedback using video clips that highlight times when caregivers interacted with their children in nurturing and synchronous ways versus times when they struggled to do so (e.g., directing or teaching, intruding on the child’s space, or being passive and disengaged). Finally, interventionists help caregivers consider how their own early experiences (e.g., not receiving nurturing care themselves) may make it more difficult to provide nurturing and synchronous care to their children.

The efficacy of the ABC intervention has been assessed in randomized clinical trials with both foster and high-risk birth parents. Notably, children randomly assigned to the ABC intervention showed lower rates of disorganized attachment than children assigned to a control intervention [40,41]. Enhancing rates of organized attachment seems particularly important, given associations between disorganized attachment and self-regulatory difficulties [42]. Children who received the ABC intervention also showed more normative cortisol production than those who received the control intervention [43–45]. These results are exciting in demonstrating the power of a relatively brief parenting intervention to affect both behavioral and biological functioning of at-risk children.

The present study is a follow-up of a subset of children whose parents previously participated in a randomized trial of the ABC intervention when children were infants and toddlers. We examined executive function and theory of mind when children were preschoolers.

Methods

Participants

Participants included 61 children (50.8% male) between the ages of 4 and 6 years (mean M = 60.3 months; SD = 8.6 months). Of these, 37 had histories of foster care placement before the age of 3 years (M age at first placement = 4.2 months; SD = 9.3 months). Before age 20 months, foster children were randomly assigned to receive the ABC intervention (n = 17) or a control intervention (n = 20). Postintervention, foster children were assessed annually up until the age of 6 years. Comparison children (n = 24), who had never been in foster care, were recruited through their previous participation in a separate research study [46].

Children included in the sample were ethnically diverse (42.6% African American; 36.1% European American; 21.3% Hispanic, Asian American, or biracial). All the parents in the sample were female, and 57.4% of parents were European American, 39.3% were African American, and 3.3% were Asian American. All except one of the parents (1.6%) had earned at least the equivalent of their high school diploma (42.6%), and many had additionally attained an associate’s or bachelor’s degree (32.8%) or a postgraduate degree (23.0%). Most parents were married (70.5%), with the remaining parents indicating their relationship status as single, never married (13.1%), divorced or separated (6.6%), dating or living together (4.9%), or widowed (4.9%). The mean annual income of families in the study was $78,425 (SD = $53,176).

Among the foster children (n = 37), most had been adopted or reunited with their birth parents (94.6%; n = 35) at a mean age of 19.9 months (SD = 13.2 months). By the age of 4–6 years, 21 children were placed with foster parents who had adopted them (56.8%); 11 were placed with biological relatives who had adopted them (29.7%); three had been reunited with biological parents after a history of foster care (8.1%); and two were placed with foster parents who had not adopted them (5.4%). All children had been initially placed into foster care because of caregiver neglect, parental psychopathology, or parental incarceration. Most children had been initially placed into foster care within the first month of life (64.9%), with the remaining children having been placed into foster care between the ages of 1.5 and 12 months (24.3%) or between the ages of 15 and 36 months (10.8%). On average, children had been placed with their current caregivers when they were 7.5 months old (SD = 10.9 months). More than half of the children had experienced a single stable placement (54.1%), with the remaining children having experienced two (27.0%) or three (18.9%) placement changes before the current placement.
Procedure

At an initial home visit, research staff attained consent and parents completed a background information questionnaire. Additionally, research staff administered the theory of mind (5 min) and receptive vocabulary (20 min) assessments. At a subsequent laboratory visit, the cognitive flexibility (5 min) task was administered.

Measures

Cognitive flexibility. The Dimensional Change Card Sort (DCCS) [47] was used to provide an index of preschool executive function. The DCSS is an experimenter-administered task in which children are asked to sort a series of cards (e.g., red rabbits and blue boats) into separate piles according to one dimension (color; “preswitch”) and then, after completing six trials, according to the other dimension (shape; “postswitch”). Most 3-year-old children perseverate by continuing to sort according to the first dimension, despite being reminded to sort by the second dimension at every new trial. Children’s performance on the DCSS improves with age and correlates positively with other measures of executive function and theory of mind [11,19]. The measure has also been found to differentiate children diagnosed with clinical disorders characterized by executive function deficits, such as attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder and autism, from healthy control subjects [48,49]. Following task guidelines, children were credited one point for every card they sorted correctly. Children’s preswitch scores ranged from 0 to 6 (M = 5.75; SD = 1.1), as did their postswitch scores (M = 4.2; SD = 2.6).

Theory of mind. The penny-hiding game [50] was administered to assess children’s theory of mind abilities. Children’s scores on the penny-hiding game at the age of 3 years have been shown to correlate moderately with their scores 1 (r = .40) and 2 years later (r = .35) [8]. The task has been shown to be developmentally sensitive and to distinguish between autistic children, mentally retarded children, and control children [50]. To administer this task, the researcher placed both hands behind her back and hid a penny in one hand. Both closed hands were then shown to the child, and the child was asked to guess in which hand the penny was hidden. Three demonstration trials were presented, and then the child was asked to hide the penny for three test trials. For each of the test trials, the child earned one point each for hiding both hands behind his or her back, presenting both hands to the researcher for guessing, and keeping the penny concealed at all times. Across the full sample, children’s scores on the task ranged from 1 to 9 (M = 7.9; SD = 2.0).

Prenatal risk indices. Parents provided information regarding three prenatal risk factors: premature birth (i.e., birth at <37 weeks’ gestation), low birth weight (i.e., birth weight of <2,500 g), and prenatal drug exposure (i.e., exposure to any illegal drugs or alcohol during pregnancy). Each of these three individual risk factors was scored as present or absent and summed into a cumulative prenatal risk index for each child, as suggested in the study by Burchinal et al [51]. Prenatal risk indices were missing for 13 foster children whose parents were unsure of whether the child experienced a specific risk factor.

Receptive language abilities. The Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test, third edition (PPVT-III) [52], was used to assess child receptive language abilities. The PPVT-III is a standardized assessment, in which children are presented with four pictures and asked to point to the picture of a stated word. In the present study, standard scores on the PPVT-III ranged from 70 to 142 (M = 107.1; SD = 15.4).

Parent psychopathology and recent life stress. Parents completed the Brief Symptom Inventory [53], which consists of 53 items rated on a 5-point scale. Scores on the global severity index were used as a measure of current parent psychopathology. Overall, scores ranged from 33 to 80, with a mean of 48.3 (SD = 11.0). Parents also completed the Life Experiences Scale [54] as an index of recent life stressors. Parents indicated whether any of the events (e.g., “marriage,” “death of a relative”) occurred within the past 6 months and whether they were experienced as “bad,” “good,” or “neutral.” The total score (sum of positive, negative, and neutral events) was used as an estimate of recent life stressors, with scores ranging from 0 to 18 (M = 4.2; SD = 4.3).

Results

Preliminary analyses

Children in the foster care control (FCC) group were younger than children in the nonfoster comparison (NFC) group (F(1,42) = 10.87, p = .00). Additionally, the composition of the groups differed significantly with regard to both child gender (χ²[2, N = 61] = 8.92, p = .01) and child ethnicity (χ²[4, N = 61] = 15.21, p = .00). Specifically, the ABC group comprised a greater number of girls (76.5%), whereas the NFC group comprised a greater number of boys (70.8%). Moreover, the FCC group predominantly comprised African American children (70.0%), whereas the ABC and NFC groups included greater proportions of European American children (41.2% and 58.3%, respectively). However, there were no significant gender or ethnicity differences in children’s cognitive flexibility or theory of mind scores (p values > .05).

However, there were significant group differences in parent education (F(2,58) = 27.44, p = .00) and family income (F(2,58) = 9.57, p = .00), with parents in the NFC group reporting attaining a higher level of education and earning a higher annual income relative to ABC and FCC parents. Additionally, parents who had received the ABC intervention reported earning a higher annual income than FCC parents (F(1,35) = 7.48, p = .01). Parent education and family income were highly correlated (r = .62, p = .00); thus, a single socioeconomic status (SES) composite variable was created by summing the z scores of these two variables.

The ABC and FCC groups differed significantly from the NFC group with regard to the prenatal risk index (F(2,45) = 9.71, p = .00), which appeared driven by foster children having been more likely to experience prenatal drug and alcohol exposure, relative to NFC children (χ²[2, N = 61] = 25.40, p = .00). However, the proportion of children who had been born prematurely (χ²[2, N = 57] = 1.82, p = .40) and/or at a low birth weight (χ²[2, N = 48] = 3.68, p = .16) did not differ significantly by group. The ABC and FCC groups did not differ significantly from each other in the individual prenatal risk factors or overall prenatal risk indices (p values > .05).

Additionally, the prenatal risk indices were not significantly associated with the cognitive flexibility or theory of mind outcomes (p values > .05).

Children in the NFC group attained higher receptive language scores than ABC children (F(1,39) = 6.32, p = .02) and the FCC children (F(1,42) = 12.58, p = .00). However, these
group differences did not hold significance when controlling for SES (p values > .05). The groups did not differ significantly with regard to current parental psychopathology (F(2,58) = .19, p = .83). Parents in the ABC group reported experiencing significantly more recent life events relative to the NFC group (F(1,39) = 6.50, p = .02). However, only child age, child receptive language scores, and family SES composites were significantly correlated with one or both of the study-dependent variables (r values ranging from .28 to .44; p values < .05). Therefore, further analyses were initially conducted controlling for these three variables. However, when included in the main analyses with child receptive language scores, child age and family SES were no longer significantly associated with the dependent variables; thus, child receptive language score was the only variable included as a covariate in all of the following analyses.

Main analyses. To examine differences in children’s cognitive flexibility, a 2 × 3 repeated-measures analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) was conducted, controlling for child receptive language scores. Task type (preswitch, postswitch) was the within-subjects factor; group (ABC, FCC, NFC) was the between-subjects factor; and children’s performance on the cognitive flexibility task was the dependent variable. Results of the ANCOVA revealed a significant main effect of group (F(2,59) = 4.59, p = .01) when controlling for child receptive language scores (Figure 2). The independent variables predicting theory of mind accounted for 17.4% of the variance, with group accounting for approximately 13% (η² = .14) of the variance in the outcome.

Contrasts using a Bonferroni-adjusted critical value showed that children in the ABC group (M = 8.76, SD = .44) scored higher than children in the FCC group (M = 6.80, SD = 2.51) on the theory of mind task (Mcontrast = 1.96, p = .01, 95% CI = .49, 3.44), and the effect size for this contrast was large (d = 1.08). Relative to NFC children (M = 8.17, SD = 1.71), children in the ABC group did not differ significantly in their theory of mind scores (Mcontrast = .60, p = .90, 95% CI = -.81, 2.01), but children in the FCC group scored marginally lower than children in the NFC group (Mcontrast = -1.37, p = .05, 95% CI = -.02, -.27).

Discussion

Preclinical and human studies alike suggest that the developing brain is vulnerable to the effects of early caregiving adversity [55–58]. Perhaps related, young children in foster care often develop problems regulating emotions, behavior, and physiology [32,42]. The ABC intervention was designed to target specific issues that are especially salient for young children who have experienced early foster care placement. This intervention was previously found to effectively promote the development of...
young children’s secure/organized attachments to caregivers [40,41] and to enhance their physiological regulation [43–45].

The present study further suggests that the ABC intervention supports normative development of executive function and theory of mind capabilities by preschool age, outcomes important for school adjustment and social competence [7]. These results highlight the potential of a relatively brief parenting intervention to improve the self-regulatory capabilities of young foster children by increasing nurturing parental care and synchronous interactions within parent–child dyads. Although a limitation of this study is the small sample size and the inequality of the three groups on several demographic variables, our results remained significant when controlling for demographic differences, and intervention effects were detected despite the small sample. These results provide preliminary support for the long-term efficacy of the ABC intervention approximately 2 years postintervention. Our findings suggest the importance of early intervention for young children in foster care and demonstrate the potential protective power of enhancing the parent–child relationship in terms of young foster children’s development of self-regulatory capabilities.

Acknowledgments

This research was supported by National Institute of Mental Health grants 52135, 84135, and 74374, and support from Edna Bennett Pierce to the second author.

References


